

STATE OF COLORADO  
DEPARTMENT OF MILITARY & VETERANS AFFAIRS  
Regulation 1-1



Personnel General

**PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT AND  
EVALUATION PROGRAM 2007**

The Adjutant General  
Centennial, Colorado  
April 2007

**UNCLASSIFIED**

**Department of Military and Veterans Affairs Regulation 1-1**

Personnel – General

---

STATE OF COLORADO PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT AND EVALUATION PROGRAM

---

Order of the Governor:

H. MICHAEL EDWARDS, Maj. Gen., COANG  
The Adjutant General

---

**Performance Management and Evaluation Program**

**Purpose:** This regulation establishes Colorado Department of Military and Veterans Affairs policy, criteria and administrative instructions concerning performance planning and evaluations.

**Applicability:** This regulation is applicable to all State Employees within the Department, as well as Technicians, AGRs and others who supervise those Employees.

**Proponent:** The proponent of this regulation is the Colorado Adjutant General for the Department of Military and Veterans Affairs.

**Internal Control System:** This regulation is not subject to the requirements of AR 11-2. It does not contain internal control provisions.

**EEO Statement:** Achievement pay adjustments approved for granting to State personnel will be made without regard to race, color, creed, sex, age, or national origin.

**Supplementation:** Supplementation to this regulation is prohibited unless prior approval is obtained from the Office of the Adjutant General of the State of Colorado.

**Suggested Improvements:** The proponent of this regulation is the Colorado Adjutant General. Users of this regulation are invited to send comments and suggested improvements directly to DMVA, ATTN: State Human Resources Director, 6848 South Revere Parkway, Suite 260, Centennial, CO 80112-6703.

**Distribution and Restrictions:** Approved for public release. Local and electronic reproductions authorized.

**Changes:** This document is subject to change as Colorado Code of Regulation 801 is revised by the Department of Personnel and Administration and/or the State Personnel Board.

---

This regulations supersedes all previous guidance on Performance Pay dated prior to April 1, 2007

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

### CHAPTER 1 – General Information

1-1	Background	3
-----	------------	---

### CHAPTER 2 - Performance Management

2-1	General	3
2-2	Employee Performance Plan	3
2-3	Year-End Performance Evaluation	4
2-4	AGR's and Federal Technicians	5
2-5	Review Process	5

### CHAPTER 3 – Achievement Pay Adjustments

3-1	General	6
3-2	Parameters	6

### CHAPTER 4 - Employee Dispute Resolution Process

4-1	General	7
4-2	Internal Process	7
4-3	External Process	8

### CHAPTER 5 - Miscellaneous

5-1	Transfers Out	9
5-2	Separation	9
5-3	Diversity	9
5-4	Ongoing Training	9
5-5	Evaluation of DMVA Achievement Pay Program	9
5-6	Annual Report Requirements	10

### APPENDICES

Appendix A – Performance Plan and Evaluation Form 623-1  
Appendix B – Employee Dispute Resolution Process

## **Chapter 1 General Information**

### **1-1. Background**

a. At the request of the Colorado State Legislature in 1996, the Department of Personnel was tasked with developing an alternate system to replace the automatic anniversary pay increases by which State Employees were being compensated. Considerable latitude was given to develop policies and tools tailor-made based on each Department's own culture and management style, within the parameters set forth for the State as a whole.

b. Late Spring of 2000, the State Legislature required the State Department of Personnel to revise the parameters and procedures for Performance Management and Evaluation. A modified system was presented by the State Department of Personnel on August 31, 2000 and new Rules and Procedures were implemented. As a result, automatic anniversary "step" increases ceased effective June 30, 2002.

## **Chapter 2 Performance Management and Evaluation**

### **2-1. General**

Performance Management and Evaluation is a system whereby performance is proactively defined and managed so that Employees are compensated based on their individual job performance rather than based solely on longevity. The Supervisor is responsible for assuring that the Employee is fully aware of the aspects of the assigned tasks and the expectations by which they will be evaluated. It is also the Supervisor's responsibility to act as a coach to guide, direct, and train Employees in order that they may reach the fullest potential in performance of the job. The Supervisor will be held accountable, and will be rated on his/her management of the Employee's performance. Performance Management and evaluation consists of plan development, conducting coaching and feedback throughout the year, and providing final performance ratings.

### **2-2. Employee Performance Plan**

a. DMVA's Performance Management and Evaluation cycle begins April 1 and concludes the following March 31. A Performance Plan is established in April of each year for all permanent Employees. Supervisors and Employees are to develop the standards (measures and elements) together on the prescribed form. Supervisors must consider the input of Employees when developing a Performance Plan. If properly utilized, the Performance Plan is a means to insure that the work unit standards are identified and that Employees are being compensated commensurate with their performance in achievement of those standards. The PDQ should be used as a resource in the planning phase. The Department of Personnel requires all Performance Plans to include Statewide "uniform core competencies" consisting of communication, interpersonal skills, customer service, accountability and job knowledge. Employee Performance Plans should align with DMVA's goals and objectives.

b. New Employees, including transfers, and those who promote, demote or lateral into another position, must receive a Performance Plan within thirty (30) days of appointment. If an Employee moves to another appointing authority or Department during a performance cycle, an interim overall evaluation shall be completed and delivered to the Human Resources office within thirty (30) days of departure. If a Supervisor does not complete a Performance Plan or review, the Reviewer is responsible for its completion, and on up the chain of command. The Supervisor will, then, not be eligible for achievement pay.

c. The DMVA Human Resources Office must receive a copy of the top sheet of the Performance Plan, documenting agreement and signatures, no later than April 30 each year or within 30 days of hire or transfer, unless otherwise determined. One yearly coaching and feedback session is mandatory in October of each year at a minimum and should be noted on the Performance Management and Evaluation form in the appropriate space and initialed by both the Employee and the Supervisor. More than one coaching and feedback session during the year is highly encouraged and may be documented directly on the form. The Supervisor is not required to detail items discussed at the interim coaching and feedback session on the form unless they choose to do so. Again, a copy of the front page that reflects the initials of the Employee and Supervisor verifying that a coaching and feedback session was completed should be faxed or delivered to the DMVA State Human Resources Office upon completion.

## 2-3. Year-End Performance Evaluation

a. At the end of each rating year (March 31), Supervisors must meet with their subordinates to share information about the Employee's performance during the past year. The Supervisor should take into account information provided by the Employee prior to making a final rating determination. After discussion with the Employee, the Supervisor can complete the form in writing, including comments, and assign a proposed rating. The Reviewer and Supervisor should then meet to discuss the proposed rating and come to a final written agreement. Proposed level 3 ratings must be in writing on the appropriate form and forwarded to the DMVA Human Resource Office who will present it to the Management Review Committee for consideration and approval/denial.

b. Timelines will be strictly adhered to for Supervisors who are State Employees, and a factor will be incorporated into their performance plan to this effect. If the Supervisor does not conduct an evaluation within thirty (30) days of the close of the evaluation period, the Reviewer shall complete the evaluation. If neither party completes the evaluation, the next level Supervisor is responsible and continues up the chain of command until complete. Any Employee who does not receive an evaluation for the prior year will automatically default to a Level 2 rating, and may dispute the default rating. The rating will not be considered final if the dispute resolution process is sought.

c. The Plan and Evaluation form has a section for writing individual technical performance standards, with a comment section for each. Ratings on each technical standard are to be given at one of two levels. If an Employee meets the definition of a Level 3 rating, the Supervisor must make a recommendation to the Management Oversight Committee, with specific justification, for review and approval/denial. Employees must have an overall technical factor rating of 85% to be eligible for a Level 3 Recommendation. Level 3 Recommendations must be outlined in detail within the "Level 3 Recommendation" section of the Performance Management Planning and Evaluation form. Level 3 should be rare and difficult to achieve and "represent consistently exceptional and documented performance or consistently superior achievement beyond the regular assignment." Five Statewide core competencies are mandatory in each Employee's plan and they will be rated on these competencies as "met" or "needs improvement."

### d. Performance Levels – Definitions:

#### Level 3

This rating represents consistently exceptional and documented performance or consistently superior achievement beyond the regular assignment. Employees make exceptional contribution(s) that have a significant and positive impact on the performance of the unit or the organization and may materially advance the mission of the organization. The Employee provides a model for excellence and helps others to do their jobs better. Peers, immediate supervision, higher-level management and others can readily recognize such a level of performance.

#### Level 2

This rating level encompasses a range of expected performance. It includes Employees who are successfully developing in the job, Employees who exhibit competency in work behaviors, skills, and assignments, and accomplished performers who consistently exhibit the desired competencies effectively and independently. These Employees are meeting all the expectations, standards, requirements, and objectives on their performance plan and, on occasion, exceed them. This is the Employee who reliably performs the job assigned and may even have a documented impact beyond the regular assignments and performance objectives that directly supports the mission of the organization.

#### Level 1

This rating level encompasses those Employees whose performance does not consistently and independently meet expectations set forth in the performance plan as well as those Employees whose performance is clearly unsatisfactory and consistently fails to meet requirements and expectations.

Marginal performance requires substantial monitoring and close supervision to ensure progression toward a level of performance that meets expectations. Although these Employees are not currently meeting expectations, they may be progressing satisfactorily toward a Level 2 rating and need coaching/direction in order to satisfy the core expectations of the position.

e. If an Employee receives an overall Level 1 rating, that Employee shall receive a corrective action and be ineligible for achievement pay. An Employee who does not meet a Level 2 or receives a "Needs Improvement" on more than three of the Core Competency factors will likewise be ineligible for any achievement pay regardless of their rating on the Technical

portion of the evaluation and their score will automatically revert to a Level 1. Those employees who achieve a Level 2, but receive more than one "Needs Improvement" Core Competency ratings, are ineligible for a Level 3 Recommendation.

f. In the event the Supervisor does not perform a timely plan or evaluation, and absent extraordinary circumstances (which does not include a heavy work load), the Supervisor (or Reviewer) is not eligible for achievement pay for that performance year and will receive a corrective action. Supervisors who do not complete evaluations within 30 days of the corrective action are subject to further action, as provided in the State Director's Administrative Procedures P-6-5, of disciplinary suspension in increments of one workday following the pre-disciplinary meeting.

g. All evaluations must be completed, including Reviewer signature, and received in the DMVA Human Resources Office by April 30, absent extenuating circumstances.

h. New Employees, except Transfers, whose effective hire date is after December 31 in the performance year, will receive a Performance Plan, and the March 31 rating can be abbreviated.

i. Employees who transfer in to DMVA without a break in State service will be evaluated by their DMVA Supervisor only for the period of DMVA employment. DMVA Human Resources must take into account the rating given by the former Department, and the final evaluation score will be prorated to reflect a combination of former and current Supervisor ratings as well as period of time for each rating to average an overall score. Employees that transfer into DMVA after April 30<sup>th</sup> will receive achievement pay based upon the final evaluation received from the previous department.

#### **2-4. AGRs and Federal Technicians**

AGR and Federal Technicians who supervise State Employees will have a performance element built into their appraisal/efficiency report that they must comply with Colorado Revised Statutes and this Implementation Plan. If standards and timelines are not met they will receive a mandatory unsatisfactory rating on this element. Additionally, they must attend training classes on Performance Management and evaluation provided by the DMVA Human Resources Office. The AGR or Federal Technician's Supervisor will be held accountable for any non-compliance of their subordinates.

#### **2-5. Review Process**

a. As Stated above, prior to a final rating being given to an Employee, all evaluations must be reviewed by the individual designated by each work unit as the "Reviewer." In most cases this will be the Supervisor's Supervisor. The "Reviewer" may be higher up the chain of command in some work units. The Reviewer will monitor the quality and consistency of performance ratings, taking particular note of discrepancies that may reflect bias based on age, gender, ethnicity, disability, sexual orientation, friendship, and the like. The Reviewer will communicate any appearance of bias or other rating error to the Supervisor and request a response. If it is determined by the Reviewer that there is indeed a discrepancy, the Supervisor will be directed to make such changes and will assure fairness and accuracy among ratings. Employees in each work unit will be advised of the name of their Reviewer. The Reviewer and Supervisor should come to an agreement as to the rating prior to presenting to the Employee.

b. All evaluations that include a recommendation for Level 3 achievement pay must be reviewed by a Management-level Committee chaired by the Appointing Authority, unless delegated. The DMVA Human Resource Director will act as an advisory member to the committee. The function of this committee, based upon their impartiality and expertise, will be to meet once each year to review Level 3 recommendations. It will be a "quality" review from an objective viewpoint. The committee will mainly be looking for substance in the required mandatory narrative section that accompanies the Level 3 recommendation, as well as fairness and consistency, and whether the recommendation includes how the Employee meets the characteristics of a Level 3 performer. If the committee has concerns or does not concur with the Supervisor's recommendation, those comments will be written up and the DMVA Human Resources Director will present the committee's recommendations to the Supervisor for response. The Supervisor will have three working days to respond to the Appointing Authority. The Appointing Authority, based upon the recommendations of the Supervisor and the committee, will have the final decision as to whether the Level 3 recommendation is consistent with the spirit and intent of the plan and is therefore, eligible to approve. This decision will be communicated to the Supervisor who must modify the rating, if necessary, before presenting it to the Employee for the evaluation. The Employee will sign, and the Supervisor will return the fully executed form to the DMVA Human Resource Office by June 10.

c. At any time the Appointing Authority, or designee, can call for a committee review of all or any plans and/or evaluations in order to determine whether this Implementation Plan is being executed correctly and whether plans and

evaluations are of adequate quality and consistency. If it is determined that there are any inadequacies, the Appointing Authority, or designee, will return the plans or evaluations to the Supervisor for modification. The Appointing Authority will also monitor the imposition of sanctions against Supervisors/Reviewers and insure compliance with Colorado Statutes.

d. The DMVA Human Resource Office will check plans and evaluations for "technical" correctness (i.e. math, signatures, required narratives, etc.) Incomplete or inaccurate evaluations will be returned to the Supervisor/Reviewer for necessary modifications. No evaluation will be considered "received" until all adjustments are made and returned to the DMVA Human Resource Office. A log will be maintained as to the date plans and evaluations are received from each Supervisor AND necessary parties will be advised of timeliness and correctness of plans and evaluations.

e. Multi-source assessments, such as formal feedback from co-workers and customers, may be utilized when feasible as part of the Employee's evaluation.

## **Chapter 3**

### **Performance award Adjustments**

#### **3-1. General**

a. The legislature will annually provide funds in order to accomplish performance award salary adjustments under the Performance Management and Evaluation Program. The amount of those dollars is determined annually based on a percent of the personal services general fund allocation. Any achievement pay will be made through payroll and will be based on the evaluation results of the previous evaluation year (i.e. achievement pay distribution in the fiscal year commencing July 1, will be based upon evaluation results for the plan year ending March 31). All achievement pay will be calculated and distributed within the parameters of the Performance Management and Evaluation System parameters and DMVA's criteria. Performance award adjustment values will be calculated in June of each year and Employees advised of their salary adjustment amount, if any, by mid-July. The salary adjustment dollar amounts will be based upon the Employee's July 1 salary, after any other salary adjustments, if any, have been applied.

b. In order to promote uniformity and equity throughout DMVA's State workforce, the percent for each level's achievement pay will be uniform regardless of funding source.

c. Adjustments can be base-building up to the Maximum for the range, and non-base building for Employees rated Level 3 and who are at the Maximum of the range. The final decision as to the percentage amount of each level will be made annually by the State Department of Personnel and Administration, and will apply to all Employees state-wide regardless of funding source. "Source of funds (e.g. cash, federal or general), method of funding (e.g., appropriated or cooperative agreement), and length of State service shall not be criteria for distinguishing between non-base, base building, or a combination of achievement pay." Prior to the payment of annual achievement pay, the State Department of Personnel and Administration shall specify and publish the increases for performance levels based upon available Statewide performance award funding.

d. The percent of the salary adjustments for each level will be published by DMVA each year and may change annually based upon dollars allocated by the State legislature and federal cooperative agreements. Base-building awards can be up to the range Maximum.

e. No quotas will be established as to the number of Employees who can be rated at any given level.

#### **3-2. Parameters**

a. Performance achievement adjustments will be base building, up to the Maximum of the Employee's pay range. Employees at or above Maximum must receive an approved rating of Level 3 in order to receive a non-base building achievement payment. Non-base building achievement pay must be re-earned each year. Level 2 performers are eligible for base building increases up to the Maximum of the pay range. Level 2 performers already at the Maximum of their pay range are not eligible for base-building achievement pay. If the final overall rating is Level 1, the Employee is ineligible for an annual achievement pay. Employees in saved pay status whose salary is above the Maximum will be ineligible for achievement pay. All achievement payments are based on the Employee's final overall rating. DMVA is not currently divided into teams, therefore the utilization of team awards will not be incorporated as part of the Performance Management and Evaluation Program.

b. DMVA Human Resources is required to calculate and provide to the Appointing Authority no later than June 15 of each year the performance level for which each Employee has been recommended. The dollar amount for which each Employee is eligible, "base-building" and "non-base building," and final percentages to be attached to each level will also be provided. The base pay in effect July 1 after applying other salary adjustments, if any, will be the basis for calculating the July 1 achievement payments (any pay differentials such as shift pay are excluded). The Appointing Authority (Deputy Director of DMVA) must approve the recommended amounts prior to disbursement, after consultation with federal fiscal managers and the budget manager.

c. Achievement pay adjustments for federally-funded Employees should be built into the respective federal budget requests (each appendix) one year in advance in order to include the three-month difference between the end of the State and federal fiscal year. That is, requests for cash awards to be paid effective July 1, 2005-September 30, 2005 will have been included in the federal October 1, 2004 through September 30, 2005 budget. (This will be a continuation of the method used for including automatic anniversary increases before performance awards.) Funds will be distributed from the various appendices and individual cost allocation plans. Appendices will pay only those costs billed for their appropriate share of an Employee's salary (100%, 75%, etc.), which includes achievement pay. General funds will not pay for federally funded Employees, and federal funds will not pay for generally funded Employees, nor will funds cross federal appendices.

d. Affected Employees and Supervisors will be notified of the salary adjustments prior to July payroll distribution. Such notification will indicate whether the adjustment is base or non-base building. Since the adjustment is for the previous fiscal year, non base-building adjustments will be considered obligated to the Employee effective July 1. An Employee must be employed by DMVA on July 1 to receive payment of an adjustment. The Employee's current Department as of July 1 is responsible for payment of the adjustment consistent with individual agency policies. Base-building adjustments will be included monthly commencing with the July pay, and non-base building must be paid in a lump sum annually in July.

e. An Employee granted an annual achievement payment shall not be denied the adjustment because of a corrective or disciplinary action issued for an incident after the close of the previous performance cycle.

## **Chapter 4**

### **Employee Dispute Resolution Process**

#### **4-1. General**

State Personnel Director's Administrative Procedures 8-95 through 8-98 provides for a two-staged review process for Performance Management and Evaluation Program disputes: internal and external. Employees may not grieve or appeal their performance plan or rating, but they may request a review. Employees may dispute their individual performance plan, including lack of a plan, during the planning cycle; their individual Performance Evaluation; lack of a Performance Evaluation; the application of DMVA's Performance Management Program to the individual Employee's agreement and/or evaluation; and, full payment of the salary adjustment. Employees may not dispute the content of DMVA's Implementation Plan; matters related to the funds appropriated; the Performance Evaluations and salary adjustments of other Employees; and, the amount of achievement pay, including whether it is base or non-base building, any combination or none, unless the issue involves the application of DMVA's Performance Management and Evaluation Program. Retaliation against any Employee involved in the dispute resolution process is prohibited. A description of the internal dispute resolution process, including timelines and name or position of the appointing authority, shall be given to Employees annually at the time of evaluation.

#### **4-2. Internal Process**

Employees are encouraged to resolve reviewable issues at the lowest level possible and in a timely fashion. Formal internal review procedures are as follows:

a. All requests for review must be in writing. Only the issue(s) as originally presented in writing shall be considered throughout the process. The scope of authority for any individuals making decisions throughout the dispute resolution process is limited to reviewing the facts surrounding the current action, within the limits of the agency's program.

b. The request must be made within five (5) working days of the event giving rise to the request for review (e.g. the final evaluation decision), including the day the disputable event occurred.

c. The request should be sent to the DMVA Human Resource Director, who will immediately give it to the Deputy Director for determination or delegation. All Employees must be notified of the authorized decision-maker for their disputes.

d. The Deputy Director, or designee, shall meet with the Employee and Supervisor within five (5) working days of receipt of the request unless this time frame is waived by both parties due to situations beyond their control (deployment, pre-arranged vacations, etc.) The Employee does not have an absolute right to legal representation, but may have an advisor present. A co-worker would not be considered an advisor. The Employee is expected to represent and speak for him or herself. Only issues addressed in the original written request may be discussed.

e. The Deputy Director or designee will make a final written decision within three (3) working days of the meeting, and is authorized to instruct the Supervisor to: follow DMVA's Implementation Plan; correct an error; or reconsider a Performance Evaluation or agreement, if appropriate. Mediation may be recommended. Their authority is limited to reviewing the facts within the limits of this Implementation Plan. They may not substitute their judgment for that of the Supervisor. They may not render a decision that would alter the Implementation Plan. The decision should be sent to the Supervisor, with a copy to the Employee and the DMVA Human Resources Office.

f. Based on consideration of the recommendations received from the Deputy Director, the Supervisor should then make a final decision within five (5) working days and advise the Employee of that decision.

g. At the completion of the internal stage of the dispute resolution process, issues that are disputable at the external stage may be pursued by the Employee. All Employees will be advised in writing of the deadlines and address for filing with the Appeals Unit at the State Department of Personnel. Such notice will include the requirement that they must attach a copy of the original written dispute and DMVA's final decision. This decision is final and binding relative to issues involving an individual agreement or evaluation.

#### **4-3. External Process**

a. Only the original issues involving the application of this Implementation Plan to the individual agreement and/or evaluation or full payment of an award are reviewable outside DMVA. The scope of authority for any individuals making decisions throughout the dispute resolution process is limited to reviewing the facts surrounding the current action, within the limits of the agency's program. The Employee must send a written request for review to the State Department of Personnel and Administration, Attention: Appeals Processing, 1313 Sherman Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Denver, CO, 80203, within five (5) working days of receipt of the final decision by DMVA if they wish to pursue the matter further. The request must include copies of the original issues and the final decision of the Department.

b. The State Department of Personnel and Administration or designee may select a qualified neutral third party to review the issues presented. The Director has 30 days to issue a written decision that is final and binding. Said individuals shall not substitute their judgment for that of the rater, Reviewer, or the Department's dispute resolution decision maker at the internal dispute stage.

c. Only issues originally presented in writing shall be considered throughout the dispute resolution process.

d. In reaching a final decision, these individuals have the authority to instruct a rater(s) to: a) follow agency's program; b) correct an error; or, c) reconsider an individual performance plan or final overall evaluation. They may also suggest other appropriate processes such as mediation.

### **Chapter 5 Miscellaneous**

#### **5-1. Transfers Out**

When an Employee transfers out of DMVA after July 1 and a non-base building achievement pay is owed, DMVA will be responsible for paying the remainder, if any, of that adjustment at the time of transfer [P-3-19 (A)].

#### **5-2. Separation**

Only those Employees who are employed on July 1 are eligible for payment of an award [P-3-19].

#### **5-3. Diversity**

a. DMVA's definition of diversity:

All cultures and individuals are of equal worth and bring their own uniqueness, which blended together makes for a richer, more enlightened and more productive workforce. None are of less value than another. Each is a part, which becomes a whole. Full diversity is the epitome of fairness, and represents a healthy organization in which to pool the talents of each.

b. Our policy:

To afford to all individuals, regardless of ethnicity, culture, age, gender, sexual preference, disability or religion, insofar as those facts are known or disclosed, equality in hiring into the DMVA workforce, promotions, retention, training opportunities, Performance Management ratings, performance pay adjustments, inclusion in special functions and on committees, and a safe and pleasant work environment.

c. Every effort will be made to insure that all individuals are afforded the same opportunity to achieve and be rewarded for Level 3 Performance insofar as their job performance warrants. This will be monitored and documented. Adverse action may be taken against any Supervisor found to willfully violate this policy.

#### **5-4. Ongoing Training of New Employees and Supervisors**

New Employees are briefed as a part of their New Employee Orientation. New Supervisors are trained annually by DMVA Human Resources. Employees and Supervisors are updated as changes occur through memos from, or meetings conducted by, DMVA Human Resource. DMVA may call upon assistance from DPA/DHR for Performance Management and other training. Attendance at training is mandatory for all Supervisors of State Employees, including those who are non-State. Refusal to attend training will result in an unsatisfactory performance rating. Training consists of the history and concept of Performance Management; guidance through the DMVA Implementation Plan; training as to how to write meaningful, measurable factors; the process for disputes; and how to effectively utilize performance planning/evaluation as a management tool. All are provided the Implementation Plan as well as the DMVA form.

#### **5-5. Evaluation of DMVA's Performance Management Program**

Modifications to this Program and the Plan and Evaluation form will be made and published should it be deemed appropriate or required by State legislature. Ongoing modifications are anticipated during the first years of implementation. A report will be made to the Deputy Director to include number and outcome of reviews requested by Employees; amounts and types of awards, both cash and non-cash; and other pertinent information. The Deputy Director, at his discretion, may appoint a State executive overview committee to review this and other data to determine the quality of DMVA's Performance Management and Evaluation policies. Annual report requirements will be met as requested. An annual study will be made thereafter, as necessary.

#### **5-6. Annual Report Requirements**

DMVA is required to enter achievement pay and ratings into a spreadsheet which is downloaded and reported to the State Department of Personnel within established timelines. This includes timeliness of performance plans and evaluations by Supervisors, disciplinary measures taken for non-compliant Supervisors, and percentage of ratings at various levels.

**Appendix A**

**STATE OF COLORADO**

**DEPARTMENT OF MILITARY & VETERANS AFFAIRS**

**PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT AND EVALUATION PLAN**

**for**

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Employee Name)

FY \_\_\_\_\_

**DMVA MISSION STATEMENT:**

**Provide day-to-day command and control, guidance, policies, and administrative and logistics support to the Divisions of the National Guard, Veterans Affairs and Civil Air Patrol. By statute, that support includes safekeeping and management of military real estate, veterans cemetery, equipment, facilities and buildings; publishing necessary regulations, orders and reports; maintaining records; and hiring personnel to carry out those missions.**

15 May 2012

**PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT AND EVALUATION SIGNATURE SHEET**

**DEMOGRAPHIC DATA:**

Employee: \_\_\_\_\_ Location: \_\_\_\_\_  
Class Title: \_\_\_\_\_ Position #: \_\_\_\_\_ Division: \_\_\_\_\_  
Work Unit: \_\_\_\_\_ Supervisor: \_\_\_\_\_  
Appraisal Period: From: \_\_\_\_\_ To: \_\_\_\_\_ Annual:  Interim:

**Performance Planning Section**

Established with Employee input on \_\_\_\_\_  
(Date)  
Supervisor Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Employee Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ I  Agree  Disagree with the Plan.

**COPY MUST BE PROVIDED TO EMPLOYEE AT TIME OF SIGNING. Copy of this signed sheet to DMVA Human Resources Office by April 30.**

**Coaching and Feedback Section**

	<b>Mandatory</b>	<b>Optional</b>	<b>Optional</b>
Coaching and Feedback session conducted on	_____	_____	_____
	(October)	(Date)	(Date)
Supervisor Initials	_____	_____	_____
Employee Initials	_____	_____	_____

**Copy of this signed sheet to DMVA Human Resources Office at conclusion of each Coaching & Feedback session.**

**Final Evaluation Section**

Final Evaluation completed with Employee input on \_\_\_\_\_  
(Date)

Eligible and recommended for:

- Level 1 (Complete mandatory corrective action, review with Employee, and attach to this form.)
- Level 2
- Level 3 (Level 3 Recommendation Section must be completed)

Supervisor Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Employee Signature \_\_\_\_\_ I  Did  Did Not receive a copy of the Dispute Resolution Process.

Reviewer Signature \_\_\_\_\_

**COPY MUST BE PROVIDED TO EMPLOYEE AT TIME OF SIGNING. Original final evaluation to DMVA Human Resources Office by April 30.**

**This section to be completed by Management Review Committee for Level 3 Recommendation:**

REQUEST APPROVED       REQUEST DENIED

Management Review Committee Chair Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

## PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT AND EVALUATION ANNUAL RATING SUMMARY FORM

This section completed at final evaluation

<b>CORE COMPETENCIES RATINGS:</b> <b>Number Ratings "Met"</b> _____ <small>(Combined total of "Met" and "Needs Improvement" cannot exceed 21 points)</small>	<b>Number Ratings "Needs Improvement"</b> _____
---	---

If there are two (2) or more "Needs Improvement" core competency ratings, Employee is not eligible for a Level 3 Recommendation. If there are four (4) or more "Needs Improvement" core competency ratings, Employee is not eligible for any performance award and overall evaluation rating will revert to a Level I, despite Factor/Task rating.

<b>SUPERVISORY RATING:</b> <b>Met</b> <input type="checkbox"/>	<b>Did Not Meet</b> <input type="checkbox"/>
--	--

If "did not meet," Employee is not eligible for a achievement pay or for a Level 3 Recommendation.

<b>FINAL RATING FOR JOB SPECIFIC TECHNICAL COMPETENCE:</b>		
Factor/Task 1 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 2 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 3 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 4 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 5 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 6 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 7 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
Factor/Task 8 Points _____ x	Percent of Accomplishment _____%	=      Final Points _____
<b>Overall Final Factor/Task Technical Points</b>		=      _____ (May not exceed 100)
<u>Total Points Level Equivalent:</u>		
Level 1 = Below 68: Complete mandatory corrective action and have HR review; review with Employee; and attach to this form.		
Level 2 = 68-100: Must receive at least 85% in order to be recommended for a Level 3 rating.		
Level 3 Recommendation: Complete mandatory Level 3 Recommendation Section on this form.		

<b>PERFORMANCE STRENGTH &amp; ACHIEVEMENT COMMENTS:</b> (Optional: This section can be used to set forth accomplishments, other than those in the job description, that an employee has performed outside the bounds of their job description in a positive way, yet not at a Level 3.)
<small>Use additional sheets of paper if necessary or continue on back side of this sheet.</small>

<b>PERFORMANCE GROWTH COMMENTS:</b> (Optional: This section can be used to set forth areas where an employee may want to focus their learning, to document specific areas of improvement, or to identify and place emphasis on areas that will enable an employee to train for higher level positions, etc.)
<small>Use additional sheets of paper if necessary or continue on back side of this sheet.</small>

Performance award adjustments are based on criteria set forth in the State of Colorado compensation policies and the DMVA Performance Management and Evaluation Program. After receiving the final executed evaluation form with the Rater and Reviewer's rating/recommendations, DMVA's Human Resource Office will calculate the dollar amount for which each Employee may be eligible based on the Employee's Performance Evaluation (i.e. Level 1, 2, or 3) and based on each Employee's salary relative to the "Maximum" for her/his classification.

## STATEWIDE CORE COMPETENCIES

Employees are evaluated on each of the core competencies listed below. A competency is a measurable pattern of skills, knowledge, abilities, behaviors and other characteristics that an individual needs to perform work roles or occupational functions successfully. These competencies are mandatory and universal across the State system.

Instructions: At the time of evaluation, check appropriate rating scale indicating whether the competency factor was “met” or “needs improvement” during the rating period. **Two or more core competency factors rated as “Needs Improvement” will preclude the Employee from receiving a recommendation for a Level 3. Four or more core competency factors rated as “Needs Improvement” will preclude an employee from receiving any performance award and overall rating will automatically revert to a Level I, despite technical factor ratings.**

**COMPETENCY:**

**RATING SCALE:**

Needs		Met
Improvement		

**Communication:** The Employee effectively communicates by actively listening and sharing relevant information with co-workers, Supervisor(s) and customers so as to anticipate problems and ensure the effectiveness of the Department of Military & Veterans Affairs.

The Employee has a demonstrated ability to:

Communicate respectfully with others



Maintain confidentiality



Respond in a prompt and courteous manner to requests and inquiries



Comments:

**Interpersonal Skills:** The Employee interacts effectively with others to establish and maintain smooth working relations. The Employee develops and maintains smooth working relations by successfully interacting with others around her/him. The Employee gains confidence and trust, considers and responds tactfully to the needs of others, takes personal responsibility for own words and actions.

The Employee has a demonstrated ability to:

Treat others with respect



Treat others fairly and without prejudice or bias.



Be depended upon by peers.



Promote cooperation and teamwork



Build trust and work with integrity



Comments:

**COMPETENCY:**

**RATING SCALE:**

Needs  
Improvement      Met

**Customer Service:** The Employee demonstrates responsible personal and professional conduct, which contribute to the overall goals and objectives of the Department of Military & Veterans Affairs, and works effectively with internal/external customers to satisfy service expectations.

The Employee has a demonstrated ability to:

- |   |                          |                          |                          |
|---|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| Treat the customer with respect and courtesy                    | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Provide consistent, quality service to all customers            |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Offer appropriate and innovative solutions to customer problems | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Meet customer expectations in a timely manner                   | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Comments:

**Accountability:** The Employee's work behaviors demonstrate responsible personal and professional conduct, which contribute to the overall goals and objectives of the Department of Military & Veterans Affairs.

The Employee takes initiative to improve professional growth and development to improve the functioning of the Department; and has a strong work ethic that relates to accomplishing the goals and mission.

The Employee has a demonstrated ability to

- |  |                          |                          |                          |
|--|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| Provide consistent, timely, high quality work                                  | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Complete work by established time lines or in advance of deadlines             | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Keep confidential information confidential                                     |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Adhere to established work schedule  | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Seek new and/or additional training opportunities to obtain mastery over tasks | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Display a high degree of honesty/integrity                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> |                          | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Comments:

**Job Knowledge**

The Employee is skilled in job-specific knowledge which is necessary to provide the appropriate quantity and quality of work in a timely and efficient manner. The Employee utilizes and upgrades knowledge of the skills that make him/her an asset to the Department of Military & Veterans Affairs.

The Employee has a demonstrated ability to:

- |   |                          |                          |
|---|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| Remain current on professional/technical knowledge and/or licensing             | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Show professional/personal pride in her/his work                                | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Instill confidence in recipients of service regarding her/his area of expertise | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Comments:



## **JOB SPECIFIC TECHNICAL FACTORS, TASKS, AND RATING GENERAL INFORMATION**

A "Job Specific Technical Factor" is a specific statement that describes a desired behavior or result from an employee. A "Task" is a measurable pattern of skills, knowledge, abilities, behaviors and other characteristics that an individual needs to perform work roles or occupational functions successfully. Enter as many factors/tasks as will adequately reflect the expected outcomes. Factors/Tasks should be measurable and based upon the PDQ, a special project the employee is expected to accomplish in the coming year, on a specific core competency in which the supervisor wishes to emphasize, and/or on specific areas of performance.

During the planning phase, each factor/task must be assigned a weight in the form of points. A supervisor will place the greatest level of points on those areas where the highest level of attention and importance is required. The total of all points combined must equal 100. These points may be adjusted at the mid-year coaching and feedback session as needed due to changes in business plans, changes in staffing resources, changes in employee circumstances (i.e. FMLA absence), etc.

During the appraisal phase, each factor/task is assigned a percentage value between one (1) and one-hundred (100). This percentage value will represent the percent of accomplishment the employee made in achieving the factor/task. Rating an employee a percent value between one (1) and sixty-seven (67) signifies a rating where an employee is not performing at expectation consistently for that factor/task. A percent value between sixty-eight (68) and one-hundred (100) signifies a rating where an employee is performing to expectation and may exceed expectations. The three rating scales are described as follows:

Level 3 (Overall score of 85 and no more than one "Needs Improvement" Core Competency rating, in addition to meeting standards described on page 11)

This rating represents consistently exceptional and documented performance or consistently superior achievement beyond the regular assignment. Employees make exceptional contribution(s) that have a significant and positive impact on the performance of the unit or the organization and may materially advance the mission of the organization. The Employee provides a model for excellence and helps others to do their jobs better. Peers, immediate supervision, higher-level management and others can readily recognize such a level of performance.

Level 2 (Overall score of 68-100 and three or less "Needs Improvement" Core Competency ratings)

This rating level encompasses a range of expected performance. It includes Employees who are successfully developing in the job, Employees who exhibit competency in work behaviors, skills, and assignments, and accomplished performers who consistently exhibit the desired competencies effectively and independently. These Employees are meeting all the expectations, standards, requirements, and objectives on their performance plan and, on occasion, exceed them. This is the Employee who reliably performs the job assigned and may even have a documented impact beyond the regular assignments and performance objectives that directly supports the mission of the organization.

Level 1 (Overall score of 1-67 OR more than three "Needs Improvement" Core Competency ratings)

This rating level encompasses those Employees whose performance does not consistently and independently meet expectations set forth in the performance plan as well as those Employees whose performance is clearly unsatisfactory and consistently fails to meet requirements and expectations.

Marginal performance requires substantial monitoring and close supervision to ensure progression toward a level of performance that meets expectations. Although these Employees are not currently meeting expectations, they may be progressing satisfactorily toward a Level 2 rating and need coaching/direction in order to satisfy the core expectations of the position.

The rating system will be used as follows:

<b>Factor/Task Points</b>		<b>Percent of Accomplishment</b>		<b>Points Received for Factor/Task</b>
<b>20</b>	X	<b>75%</b>	=	<b>15</b>
<b>(Assuming employee accomplished 75% of the factor/task assigned to him/her.)</b>				

Only those Employees who earn an *overall* Technical Factor/Task rating of 85 or greater and have one or less "Needs Improvement" core competency ratings are eligible for a Level 3 Recommendation. Therefore, Supervisors must outline the benchmark for Level 2 and may want to further identify how an Employee can achieve higher ratings within Level 2 for each factor/task, to promote Employee understanding and define the rating scale. Benchmark levels of performance within Level 2 must be measured by: quality, quantity, accuracy and timeliness. The total of all final points must be documented on the Summary Form (Page 3).

**FACTOR/TASK 1 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 1 Description:**

**Standard for a Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 1 Points**

**X**

**Percent of Accomplishment**

**=**

**Final Points Received**

Total of all factor weights cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 2 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 2 Description:**

**Standard for a Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 2 Points**

**X**

**% of Accomplishment**

**=**

**Final Points Received**

Total of all factor weights cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished

Final points for this Factor/Task.

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 3 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 3 Description:**

**Standard for Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 3 Points**

**X**

**% of Accomplishment**

**=**

**Points Received**

Total of all factors cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 4 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 4 Description:**

**Standard for Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 4 Points**

**X**

**% of Accomplishment**

**=**

**Points Received**

Total of all factors cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 5 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 5 Description:**

**Standard for a Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 5 Points**

X

**Percent of Accomplishment**

=

**Points Received**

Total of all factors cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 6 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 6 Description:**

**Standard for a Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 6 Points**

X

**Percent of Accomplishment**

=

**Points Received**

Total of all factors cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task.

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 7 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 7 Description:**

**Standard for a Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 7 Points**

**X**

**Percent of Accomplishment**

**=**

**Points Received**

Total of all factors cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

**FACTOR/TASK 8 TITLE:**

**Factor/Task 8 Description:**

**Standard for a Benchmark Level 2:**

**Factor/Task 8 Points**

**X**

**Percent of Accomplishment**

**=**

**Points Received**

Total of all factors cannot exceed 100.

Percentage awarded must be based on 0% to 100% accomplished.

Final points for this Factor/Task.

**EVALUATION COMMENTS:** Not required for employees meeting Level 2 expectations. Justification is required when employees receive Level 1 ratings for any goal.

(Use additional sheet if necessary)

### **LEVEL 3 RECOMMENDATION SECTION**

Supervisors/Reviewers must only use this form for Level 3 Recommendations. Level 3 ratings represent consistently exceptional and documented performance or consistently superior achievement beyond the expected assignment as identified within their position description. Employees make exceptional contribution(s) that have a significant and positive impact on the performance of the unit or the organization and may materially advance the mission of the organization. The Employee provides a model for excellence and helps others to do their jobs better. Peers, immediate supervision, higher-level management and others can readily recognize such a level of performance.

Please outline how the individual's job performance this past year meets the definition in the preceding paragraph to qualify this Employee for a Level 3 award. Be specific. As a supervisor, you should enumerate extraordinary accomplishments or performance above those listed as duties in their position description. Such indicators could be: special assignments/projects that the individual took upon his or her own or accepted and accomplished above their normal assignments and/or were significant to the organization; or an individual's innovation which improved processes and/or saved DMVA money (unless saving money is an inherent part of the assignment). The contribution should be easily recognizable as a Level 3 achievement. If this section is not adequately completed, a Level 3 award cannot be considered. (Two or more Core Competency factors rated as "Needs Improvement" and/or a Technical Factor rating of 84 or below will preclude an Employee from eligibility for a Level 3 Recommendation.)

Employee Name:

This recommendation is for:  Performance (i.e. consistently exceptional performance that has a significant/positive impact on the performance of unit/organization)

Achievement (i.e. innovation, beyond regular assignment, advanced mission of the organization)

Please describe how this achievement was extraordinary or what was done consistently and beyond the regular assignment to achieve a Level III:

How and why is this outside the scope of the position or beyond the regular assignment?

Did this assignment require additional time outside the normal work hours? If so, please explain.

What benefit did this have to DMVA in terms of time, dollars, and/or results?

If this employee did not perform this function, who would assume the responsibility and/or what would the impact be to the agency had he/she not completed the function or task?

Has this person received funds or awards (i.e. acting pay) to perform this added assignment? If so, when?

## **Appendix B**

### **Employee Dispute Resolution Process**

#### **4-1. General**

Personnel Procedures P8-13 through 18 provide for a two-staged review process for Performance Management and Evaluation disputes: internal and external. Employees may not grieve or appeal their performance plan or rating, but they may request a review. Employees may dispute their individual performance plan, including lack of a plan during the planning cycle; their individual performance evaluation; lack of a performance evaluation; the application of DMVA's Achievement Pay Plan to the individual employee's plan and/or evaluation; and, full payment of the award. Employees may not dispute the content of DMVA's Implementation Plan; matters related to the funds appropriated; the performance evaluations and awards of other employees; and, the amount of a performance award, including whether it is base or non-base building, any combination or none, unless the issue involves the application of DMVA's Achievement Pay Plan. Retaliation against any employee involved in the dispute resolution process is prohibited. A description of the internal dispute resolution process, including timelines and name or position of the appointing authority, shall be given to employees annually at the time of evaluation.

#### **4-2. Internal Process**

Employees are encouraged to resolve reviewable issues at the lowest level possible and in a timely fashion. Formal internal review procedures are as follows:

- a. All requests for review must be in writing. Only the issue(s) as originally presented in writing shall be considered throughout the process.
- b. The request must be within five (5) working days of the event giving rise to the request for review (e.g. the final evaluation decision), including the day the disputable event occurred.
- c. The request should be sent to the DMVA State Personnel Director, who will immediately give it to the Appointing Authority for determination or delegation. All employees must be notified of the authorized decision-maker for their disputes.
- d. The Appointing Authority, or designee, shall meet with the employee and supervisor within five (5) working days of receipt of the request unless this time frame is waived by both parties due to situations beyond their control (deployment, pre-arranged vacations, etc.) The employee does not have an absolute right to legal representation, but may have an advisor present. A co-worker would not be considered an advisor. The employee is expected to represent and speak for him or herself. Only issues addressed in the original written request may be discussed.
- e. The Appointing Authority or designee will make a final written decision within three (3) working days of the meeting, and are authorized to instruct the supervisor to: follow DMVA's implementation plan; correct an error; or reconsider a performance evaluation or agreement, if appropriate. Mediation may be recommended. Their authority is limited to reviewing the facts within the limits of this implementation plan. They may not substitute their judgment for that of the supervisor. They may not render a decision that would alter the implementation plan. The decision should be sent to the supervisor, with a copy to the employee and the DMVA State Personnel Office.
- f. Based on consideration of the recommendations received, the supervisor should then make a final decision within five (5) working days and advise the employee of that decision.
- g. The completion of the internal stage of the dispute resolution process for issues disputable at the external stage (Personnel Director), the employee will be advised in writing of the deadlines and address for filing with the Director. Such notice will include the requirement that they must attach a copy of the original written dispute and the Department's final decision. This decision is final and binding relative to issues involving an individual agreement or evaluation.

#### **4-3. External Process**

- a. Only the original issues involving the application of this implementation plan to the individual agreement and/or evaluation are reviewable outside DMVA. The employee must send a written request for review to the State Personnel Director at Department of Personnel, 1313 Sherman Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Denver, CO 80203, within five (5) working days of receipt of the final decision by DMVA if they wish to pursue the matter further. The request must include copies of the original issues and the final decision of the Department.

b. The State Personnel Director or designee shall select a qualified neutral third party to review the issues presented. The neutral third party has 30 days to issue a written decision that is final and binding.

c. Only issues originally presented in writing shall be considered throughout the dispute resolution process.