

**Colorado Department of Health Care
Policy and Financing
Consumer Directed Care Evaluation**

**Comparative Service Cost Analysis Report
(4.12.2.1)**

June 23, 2018



4450 Arapahoe Avenue, Suite 100, Boulder, CO 80303

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Claims Data	1
Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS, IHSS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services : Elderly, Blind, Disability Waiver Participants	2
Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS, IHSS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services: Spinal Cord Injury Waiver Participants	3
Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services: Community Mental Health Services Waiver.....	3
Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS, IHSS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services: Children’s Home and Community Based Services Waiver.....	4
Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: Cost Trends for Nursing Facility and Hospital Back Up Facility Costs.....	4
Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: Cost Trends for Long-Term Home Health and Private Duty Nursing	4

Introduction

This report provides findings from the Service Cost Analysis component of the larger Consumer Directed Care (CDC) evaluation that we (TriWest Group) are conducting for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing (Department).

This report contains three sections:

1. Costs Per Day: CDASS, IHSS, and comparison group - traditional agency based care (by Medicaid Waiver program)
 - a. Health Maintenance (IHSS only)
 - b. Homemaker Services
 - c. Personal Care (including Relative Personal Care)
 - d. LTHH (Certified Nursing Assistant basic and extended unit costs)
 - e. LTHH (skilled nursing basic and brief nursing costs)
2. Costs Per Day: Non-Waiver Long Term Home Health Services and Private Duty Nursing
3. Costs Per Day: Nursing Facility

For each type of service, we compare the average cost per participant per day.

Claims Data

We received Medicaid claims for all individuals (not a random sample) who fit into any of the 12 groups that were selected for the overall participant directed care study. Details of these groups can be found in the Survey Methodology and Instrument Report. Claims data contained all Medicaid claims for any individual falling into one or more of the study groups during the 2017 calendar year. All Medicaid claims from 2013-2017 were included in the analyses.

The tables below show Medicaid-paid costs per day per client. The tables are separated by Medicaid waiver program, and show costs for CDASS, IHSS and a comparison group, made up of individuals who participate in that specific waiver, and who receive similar services, but who do not participate in CDASS or IHSS services.

Where possible, costs are divided by the type of service provided. These are costs per client per day of service. It is important to note that because of this, it is not appropriate to sum all costs to calculate a total program cost. These tables are intended to compare differences in cost across like services and are not meant to show aggregate costs.

Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS, IHSS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services : Elderly, Blind, Disability Waiver Participants

Elderly, Blind, Disability (EBD) Waiver	Average Medicaid Paid Cost per Client per Day				
	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
EBD Waiver - CDASS					
All Services¹	\$95	\$101	\$104	\$104	\$103
EBD Waiver - IHSS					
Health Maintenance	\$120	\$102	\$93	\$82	\$113
Homemaker	\$20	\$63	\$65	\$62	\$30
Personal Care	\$33	\$63	\$60	\$56	\$44
Relative Personal Care	\$25	\$70	\$61	\$59	\$49
EBD Waiver - Comparison					
Home Health Services (LTHH)	\$51	\$67	\$70	\$70	\$70
Skilled Nursing (LTHH)	\$98	\$103	\$105	\$104	\$105
Homemaker	\$22	\$21	\$21	\$24	\$24
Personal Care	\$38	\$43	\$48	\$48	\$50
Relative Personal Care	\$26	\$23	\$22	\$24	\$25

¹ Claims for CDASS participants are not broken out by specific service types, since participants are given a single allocation to manage at their discretion. The client claims submitted to the FMS do identify personal care, homemaker and health maintenance hours. It is important to note, however, that claims data was used for this report.

Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS, IHSS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services: Spinal Cord Injury Waiver Participants

Spinal Cord Injury (SCI) Waiver	Average Medicaid Paid Cost per Client per Day				
Group	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
SCI Waiver - CDASS					
All Services	\$153	\$130	\$137	\$141	\$142
SCI Waiver - Comparison²					
Home Health Services (LTHH)	\$62	\$63	\$53	\$70	\$72
Skilled Nursing (LTHH)	\$98	\$90	\$105	\$103	\$103
Homemaker	\$29	\$29	\$46	\$42	\$34
Personal Care	\$80	\$48	\$77	\$62	\$48
Relative Personal Care	\$22	\$21	\$22	\$25	\$24

Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services: Community Mental Health Services Waiver

Community Mental Health Services (CMHS) Waiver	Medicaid Paid Cost per Client per Day				
Group	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
CMHS Waiver - CDASS					
All Services	\$68	\$67	\$66	\$68	\$63
CMHS Waiver - Comparison					
Home Health Services (LTHH)	\$57	\$61	\$61	\$61	\$63
Skilled Nursing (LTHH)	\$98	\$94	\$105	\$106	\$106
Homemaker	\$21	\$21	\$21	\$23	\$24
Personal Care	\$38	\$41	\$39	\$44	\$46
Relative Personal Care	\$24	\$25	\$25	\$25	\$27

² There were too few IHSS service delivery participants under the SCI waiver to report on costs over time. Sample sizes smaller than 10 cause two issues in these analysis. One is “safe harbor” – the principal that if an individual belongs to an identified group, even when results are aggregated, they could be identified due to the membership of the group being too small. Because all that is being reported, this is a minimal risk. However, these smaller sample sizes also lead to problems when presenting average costs per day because variation across one client can cause large data variations, leading to incorrect assumptions about actual changes in costs for the population as a whole.

Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: CDASS, IHSS and Traditional Agency Based Care Services: Children's Home and Community Based Services Waiver

Children's Home and Community Based Services (CHCBS) Waiver	Average Medicaid Paid Cost per Client per Day				
Group	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
CHCBS Waiver - IHSS					
Health Maintenance	\$178	\$179	\$177	\$172	\$174
CHCBS Waiver - Comparison					
Home Health Services (LTHH)	\$78	\$83	\$70	\$85	\$88
Skilled Nursing (LTHH)	\$99	\$102	\$105	\$105	\$106

Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: Cost Trends for Nursing Facility and Hospital Back Up Facility Costs

Nursing Facility and Hospital Back Up Facility Costs	Average Medicaid Paid Cost per Client per Day				
Facility type	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Nursing Facility	\$212	\$211	\$220	\$225	\$224
Hospital Back Up Facility	\$709	\$715	\$682	\$691	\$702

Medicaid Paid Costs per Day: Cost Trends for Long-Term Home Health and Private Duty Nursing

Long-Term Home Health and Private Duty Nursing	Average Medicaid Paid Cost per Client per Day				
Facility type	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Long Term Home Health (IHSS) ³	\$71	\$73	\$76	\$79	\$79
Long Term Home Health (non-IHSS)	\$77	\$82	\$84	\$86	\$87
Private Duty Nursing	\$379	\$425	\$433	\$460	\$466

³ This line item reports Long Term Home Health (LTHH) costs for IHSS clients.